


Evaluation of Efficacy and Safety of Combined Therapy of Melasma by using Azelic, Glycolic and Kojic Acid (Unitone and Neotone)

Intisar Ahmed Hasan  (FIBMS-DV)¹, Khudhair Kh Ibrahim Al-Kayally (FIBMS-DV)²

^{1,2} College of Medicine, University of Diyala, Diyala, Iraq

Abstract

OPEN ACCESS

Correspondence Address: Intisar Ahmed Hasan

College of Medicine, University of Diyala, Diyala, Iraq

Email: Intesarahmed14@yahoo.com

Copyright: ©Authors, 2023, College of Medicine, University of Diyala. This is an open access article under the [CC BY 4.0](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) license

(<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>)

Website:

<https://djm.uodiyala.edu.iq/index.php/djm>

Received: 7 March 2023

Accepted: 19 March 2023

Published: 5 April 2023

Background: Melasma is one of the most common disorders of brown hyperpigmentation, which affect primarily the face and later on some other sites of the body, seen most commonly in women during the reproductive period and may be seen in men. Many options are used in the treatment of melasma, most commonly: hydroquinone, tretinoin, corticosteroid, azelic acid, glycolic acid, kojic acid, triaximinic acid, ascorbic acid, intralesional glutathione, and lastly medical procedures, like: microdermabrasion, chemical peel, laser and light therapy.

Objective: To evaluate the efficacy and safety of combined therapy (azelic, glycolic and kojic acids) in the treatment of melasma (UNITONE and NEOTONE).

Patients and Methods: A cross-sectional study in which (585) patients complaining of melasma (577 females and 8 males), their age ranged from (17-50) years, with a mean age of $46.15 \pm$ years. Treated by application of azelic acid (20% cream) for two hours at night, then washed and followed by topical application of combined cream consisted of (5%) glycolic acid and (1%) kojic acid throughout the night and washed in the morning, with application of sun block of ≥ 50 SPF, and oral ascorbic acid (500mg) tablet twice in the morning and evening.

Results: Out of 585, 98% was females with a mean age of (46.15 ± 8) years. Eight percent of the patients of MAIS score-1, (22.05%) of score-2, (51.28%) of score-3 and (18.8%) of score-4. Regarding the response to therapy: (44.78%) of patients showed complete clearance of the disease, (48.85%) with good response, (1.7%) of poor response and (5.47%) showed relapse of the melasma after discontinuation of the therapy, and they were retreated by the same combined formula, (93.75%) of them cleared completely and (6.25%) showed good response. Ninety percent of patients developed a variable degree of irritation, erythema and burning sensation, at the beginning of the treatment and after (10-15) days, most of them tolerated the therapy.

Conclusion: Combined therapy of azelic, glycolic and kojic acids was effective and safe in the treatment of melasma and this combination was

superior and alternative to the ordinary and corner therapy of hydroquinone and corticosteroid.

Keywords: Combination therapy, azelic, glycolic, kojic, ascorbic acids, MASI, MSI

Introduction

Melasma (face mask) is one of the most common disorders of brown hyperpigmentation, which affects primarily the face and later on some other sites of the body, most commonly in women, during the reproductive age, rarely seen in men [1]. The etiology of melasma remain obscure, but many etiological factors are implicated which include [1-3] : Hormonal changes, Prolong exposure to sun light, Genetic predisposition, Skin irritation , And some endocrinological.

The chief complain of melasma is brownish hyperpigmentation most commonly seen on the face, less commonly on the neck, shoulders, arms and the forearms [1]. Clinically facial melisma is classified into three types: the centrofacial, which is the most common type, which affect the forehead, cheeks, the upper lip and the chin, the molar type, is the second common type, seen on the maxillary area and the nose, and less commonly the mandibular type, which affect the ramus of the mandible [1,2,4].

The diagnosis is made clinically and may be confirmed, by Wood's lamp examination or histopathological examination (1,2,4,5). The severity of melasma is assessed by two scores, either melasma area and severity index (MASI) or melasma severity index (MSI). According to MASI, (which means degree and severity of pigmentation), melasma is scored into five scores (0-4): zero= normal skin, 1= just visible pigmentation, 2= mild melasma, 3= moderate, 4= sever melasma, while according MSI (which means surface area of

melasma), melasma is scored into four scores (1-4): 1≤10% of surface area, 2=11-30%, 3=31-60%, 4>60% [6].

Many therapeutic options are used in the treatment of melasma, although some times it clear spontaneously, especially those due to pregnancy and contraceptive pills, when the causes are removed and may relapsed even after successful therapy [1,2,4,7]. These therapeutic options include: hydroquinone (2-5%), corticosteroids, tretinoin, combined therapy (triple, Kligman formula: hydroquinone, tretinoin and corticosteroid), an additional topical medications like: azelic, glycolic, kojic and triaximinic acid, intralesional injection of glutathione and lastly, microdermabrasion, chemical peel, laser and light therapy[1, 4,8].

Azelic acid is naturally occurring nonphenolic saturated, nine carbon dicarboxylic acid that competitively inhibit tyrosinase, also it inhibit DNA synthesis and mitochondrial enzymes, thereby induce direct cytotoxic effects on melanocyte [9]. Ascorbic acid has antioxidant properties and affects melanogenesis, by reducing dopaquinone to DOPA and preventing free radicals production and absorption of UV radiation, used orally or topically as (5-25%) cream. Glycolic acid is an alpha-hydroxy acid, which decrease pigmentation by peeling and desquamation, as well as direct reduction in melanin formation, by inhibition of tyrosinase. Kojic acid is naturally occurring hydrophilic fungal product derived from certain species (Acetobacter, Aspergillus, and

Penicillium), act by inhibition of the production of free tyrosinase, and also act as potent antioxidant (1-4%) concentration [10]. The aim of this study was to evaluate the efficacy and safety of combined therapy (azelic, glycolic and kojic acid) in the treatment of melasma with out usage of the corner therapy the hydroquinone.

Patients and Methods

Design of the research

A cross-sectional study, in which a total number of (585) patients complaining of Melasma was seen and treated in a private clinic, in Kalar City, Al-Sulaymmania Province, Iraq, for the period, 15-Jan.2016 to 15-Jan.2017. They were (577) females and (8) males, their ages ranged from (17-50) years, with a mean age of (46.15±8) years, all of them of Fitzpatrick's skin types 3 and 4. They were fully interrogated regarding the complain, age, occupation, outdoor work, reproductive life (including menstrual cycle, pregnancy, contraceptive pills and hormonal therapy), duration of the disease, progression and therapy used, any skin and systemic disease and if these diseases were treated or not and what type of therapy used for the treatment of these diseases. The disease was diagnosed clinically and confirmed by using Wood's lamp. The severity of the melasma was assessed by using the MASI scoring.

After a written concept was obtained, all patients were treated by topical application of (20%) azelic acid cream for two hours at night, then washed and followed by topical application of cream consisted of (5%) glycolic acid and (1%) kojic acid, overnight and washed in the morning, then a sun block of SPF \geq 50 was applied every three hours, and oral ascorbic acid (vitamin-c), (500mg)

tablets in the morning and at night after meal as an antioxidant. The patients were followed up and examined every two weeks by the observer and patients satisfaction, to evaluate the response to therapy, which continue for (25-60) days in most of the patients (72.99%) Table(1).

Statistical Analysis

All data collected have been entered on an excel sheet, Chi-square test was used to assesse the statistical variants of the result. The response to therapy was graded into three grades: either complete clearance, good response (75-90%lightening, i.e. only trace of light brown pigmentation, MASI score-1) or poor response (resistant cases).

Results

A cross-sectional study in which (585) patients with melasma were included, they were (577, 98.6%) females and (8, 1.4%) males, with a mean age of (46.15±8) years. They were treated by combination therapy of: azeli, glycolic, kojic and ascorbic acid, as described in methods and patients were advised to use sun screen after discontinuation of therapy.

Table (2) revealed the results of MASI scoring of the patients involved in the study, they were (110, 18.8%) patients of score-4 (sever hyperpigmentation), (300,51.28%) patients of score-3(moderate hyperpigmentation), (130,22.05%) patients of score-2 (mild hyperpigmentation) and (45,7.6%) patients of score-1 (just visible light brown pigmentation). Regarding the duration of therapy (Table-1), (427, 72.99%) patients used therapy for (25-60) days, (139, 23.89%) patients for (61-150) days and (19,3.12%) patients used the therapy for (151-300) days .

The study revealed Table(3), that (262,44.78%) patients showed complete clearance of the disease, with MASI score-zero, (281,48.85%) patients had good response, with MAIS score-1, (10,1.7%) patients of poor response (resistant to therapy) and (32,5.47%) patients showed relapses of the disease after discontinuation of therapy and they were retreated by the same formula, of them (30,93.75%) patients cleared completely and (2,6.25%) patients showed good response . Ninety percent (527) of patients developed variable degree of irritation at the beginning of treatment, with

erythema and burning sensation, and after (10-15) days, most of them tolerated the therapy.

The response according MASI score Table (4),in those patients with complete clearance of the disease, there was done grading of different MASI scores to score-zero (clear, normal skin) with P=0.05, patients with good response, shows done grading of MASI score to score-1 (just light hyperpigmentation), P=0.02, while patients with poor response, there was either down grading of MASI scores from 4 to 3 or 3 to 2 or 1, or there was no response (resistant cases) P=0.1.

Table (1): Duration of therapy in patients with melisma

Duration in days	No. of patients	Percentage%
25-60	427	72.99
61-150	139	23.89
151-300	19	3.12

Table (2): Number of patients according to MASI scores (severity of melasma)

MASI score	No. of patients	Percentage%
1	45	7.6
2	130	22.05
3	300	51.28
4	110	18.8

Table (3): Number of patients according to response to therapy

Response	No. of patients	Percentage%	P-value
Cleared	262	44.78	0.05
Good	281	48.5	0.02
Poor	10	1.7	0.1
Relapsed	32	5.47	0.05
Total	585	100	

Table (4): Response to therapy according to MASI scores

Response	No. of patients	Percentage%	MASI score before therapy	MASI score after therapy	P-value
Cleared	262	44.78	1,2,3,4	0	0.05
Good	281	48.85	2,3,4	1	0.02
Poor	10	1.7	1,2,3,4	1,2,3,4	0.1
Relapsed	32	5.47	1,2,3,4	0	0.05
Total	585	100			



Figure (1): Before treatment



Figure (2): After treatment

Discussion

This study using an alternative, second line therapy to the old corner therapy ,(hydroquinone or the triple Kingman's formula), in the treatment of melasma (mask face), which was used for long time and giving a variable response, duration of therapy, and side effects like exogenous ochronosis and satellite pigmentation [1,2,3,11].

Regarding the mean age of onset of melasma, in this study it was (46.15±8) years, which differ from that done in India (33.45) years [12]), and in Singapore (42.3)

years [13]. When compared with other studies done in different areas in USA, using the ordinary therapy (triple formula) and new therapy like: azelic, kojic and tranexamic acid (50-75%, cured or with good response) [14], this study was superior in the end results of treatment of melasma (92% cured or with good response). In comparison with fractional photothermolysis (60% cleared and good response) [15], also this study was superior. Another study done on Asian women's, using Q-switched neodymium-doped yatriam aluminum garnet laser (1064nm, QS-NdYAG)[16], showed

temporary poor response as compared with this study.

This study was parallel to that done in India, using (50%) glycolic acid facial Peel (91% improvement) [17], but it was superior to another study using (1%) tretinoin solution weekly application for (6-12) weeks (50% improvement)⁽¹⁸⁾, and also highly superior to that study used to evaluate intradermal microinjection of tranexamic acid, performed on women with melasma in South Korea (only 9.4% showed good response [19]).

Conclusions

It was concluded that combination therapy of azelic, glycolic, kojic and oral ascorbic acid was superior to other studies using the old hydroquinone and triple formula as well as laser and photothermolysis therapy.

Recommendations

I recommend to use emollient cream with topical Azelic acid to decrease irritation and increase patient compliance also recommend to use maintenance cream as Glycolic, Kojic acid after the treatment course to avoid relapse.

Source of funding: The current study was funded by our charges with no any other funding sources elsewhere.

Ethical clearance: Ethical approval was obtained from the College of Medicine / University of Diyala ethical committee for this study.

Conflict of interest: Nil

References

[1] Klaus W, Lowell A, Goldsmith SIK, Barbara A, Gril Chest A, David JT .Melasma .Fitzpatrick's, Dermatology in General Medicine, Copyright 2008, 7th ed; 1: 645.

[2] William DJ, Timothy GB, Dirk ME .Melasma. Andrews, Disease of the skin, 10th ed. 2006; Vol. 2: 854-855.

[3] Jenna F, Seemal R . New treatment and approaches in melisma. Healthline Media UK Lt, Brighton UK 200-2019.

[4] Ana CH, Luciane DB, Helio AM. Melasma, clinical and epidemiology. An.Bras. dermatol, 2014; 89(5): 1.

[5] Vaneeta M, Sheth A, Amit G. Melasma, a comprehensive update. JAAD, 2011; 65(4): 689-697.

[6] Ortonne JP, et al. A global survey of role of ultraviolet radiation and hormonal influences in development of melasma. Journal of European Academy of Dermatology and venereology, 2019; 23(11): 1254-1262.

[7] Balkrishnan R, et al. Improved quality of life with effective treatment of facial melisma, the pigment trial. J. Drugs Dermatol, 2004; 3: 377.

[8] Kang HY, Ortonne JP. What should be considered in the treatment of melasma . Annals of Dermatology, 2010; 22(4): 373-378.

[9] Nguyen QH, Bui TP. A zelic acid; Pharmacokinetic and Pharmacodynamics properties and its therapeutic role in hyperpigmentary disorders and acne. Int J Dermatol, 1995; 34: 75-84.

[10] Sonijeev H, Inderjeet K, et al. Topical treatment of melisma. India J Dermatol, 2009;54(4): 303.

[11] Guevara IL, Panddya AG. Safety and efficacy of 4% hydroquinone combined with 10% glycolic acid, antioxidant and sunscreen in the treatment of melisma. Int. J Dermartol, 2003; 42: 966.

- [12] Arun A, Sanjay KR. Clinical and epidemiological study of melisma. *Indian J Dermatol*, 2011; 56(4): 380-382.
- [13] Goh Ch, Dlova CN. Clinical presentation and treatment outcome of melasma. *Singapore Med J*, 1999; 40: 455-8.
- [14] Whitney JP. New treatment and approaches in melisma. *Dermatology Times*, 2018; 39: 6.
- [15] Cameron KR, Richard EF. Treatment of melasma with fractional photothermolysis. *Dermatol. Surg* 2003; 31: 1645-1650.
- [16] Penpun W, Ratchathron M, Sasima E. Qs:Nd:YAG laser for treatment of facial melisma. *Dermatology Surg* 2010; 36(1): 76-87.
- [17] Saeid MJ, Sanjeev H, Inderjeet K, Bhushan K. Safety and efficacy of glycolic acid facial peel in Indian women with melisma. *Int J of Dermatol*, 2001; 40(5): 354-357.
- [18] Niti Kh, Rashmi S, Jain RK. Tretinoin peels versus glycolic acid peel in treatment of melisma. *Dermatol Surg* 2004; 30(5): 756-760.
- [19] Ji Ho Cee, Jony Gap Park, Sook Hee Lim *et al.* Localized intradermal microinjection of tranexamic acid for treatment of melasma. *Dermatol Surg* 2006; 32(5): 626-631 .

تقييم فعالية وسلامة العلاج المشترك للكلف باستخدام حمض الازيليك و الجليكوليك وحمض الكوجيك

أنتصار احمد حسن^١، خضير خلف ابراهيم^٢

المخلص

خلفية الدراسة: الكلف هو واحد من الاضطرابات الأكثر شيوعاً لفرط التصبغ البني، والتي تصيب بالدرجة الاولى الوجه و بعض الاماكن الأخرى للجسم، والتي شوهدت بشكل شائع في النساء خلال الفترة الإنجابية وقد شوهدت في الرجال ايضاً. يتم استخدام العديد من الخيارات في علاج الكلف، والأكثر شيوعاً: الهيدروكينون، التريتينون، الكورتيكوستيرويد، حمض الازيليك، حمض الجليكوليك، حمض الكوجيك، احمض الفواكه، حمض الأسكوربيك، حقن موضعي للجلوتاثيون، وأخير الإجراءات الطبية، مثل: المايكرونيدلنك، التقشير الكيميائي، الليزر والعلاج الصوتي.

اهداف الدراسة: لتقييم فعالية وسلامة العلاج المشترك (أحمض الجليكوليك والجليكوليك والكوجيك) في علاج الكلف. **المرضى والطرائق:** دراسة مستعرضة تضم (٥٨٥) مريض يشكو من الكلف (٥٧٧ إناث و ٨ ذكور)، تراوحت اعمارهم من (١٧-٥٠) سنوات، مع متوسط عمر ٤٦,١٥ ±. تم العلاج بوضع حمض الازيليك (كريم ٢٠٪) لمدة ساعتين في الليل، ثم يتم غسله ويتبعه وضع الكريم المشترك الذي يتكون من حمض الجليكوليك (٥٪) وحمض الكوجيك (١٪) طوال الليل ويغسله في الصباح، مع وضع الواقي الشمسي ≤ 50 SPF في النهار، وحمض الأسكوربيك عن طريق الفم (٥٠٠ ملغ) قرص مرتين في الصباح والمساء.

النتائج: من أصل ٥٨٥، كانت ٩٨٪ هم من الإناث مع متوسط عمر (٤٦,١٥ ± ٨) سنة.

٨٪ □ من المرضى كان مقياس SCORE-1 MAIS

٢٢,٠٥٪ □ من المرضى كان مقياس MAIS SCOR-2

٥١,٢٨٪ □ من المرضى كانوا MAIS SCOR-3

١٨,٨٪ □ من المرضى كانوا MAIS SCOR-4

فيما يتعلق بالاستجابة للعلاج: (٤٤,٧٨٪) من المرضى أظهروا شفاء تاماً للمرض، (٤٨,٨٥٪) مع استجابة جيدة، (١,٧٪) من استجابة سيئة و (٥,٤٧٪) أظهرت انتكاس للكلف بعد توقف العلاج، وقد تم إعادة علاجهم بنفس الطريقة حيث ان، (٩٣,٧٥٪) تم شفائها بالكامل و (٦,٢٥٪) لاقى استجابة جيدة. عانى ٩٠٪ □ من المرضى بعض الاعراض الجانبية مثل تهيج البشرة، احمرار و الحرقلة في بداية العلاج وبعد (١٠-١٥) أيام تم التخلص من الاعراض الجانبية تدريجياً

الاستنتاجات: كان العلاج المشترك لأحمض Azelic و Glycolic و Kojic فعال وآمن في علاج الكلف وكان هذا المزيج متفوقاً وبديلاً للعلاج العادي مثل الهيدروكينون والكورتيكوستيرويد.

الكلمات المفتاحية: العلاج المشترك، حمض الازيليك، حمض الجليكوليك، حمض الكوجيك، حمض الاسكوربيك، مقياس ماسي، مقياس الكلف

البريد الإلكتروني: Intesarahmed14@yahoo.com

تاريخ استلام البحث: ١٠ آذار ٢٠٢٢

تاريخ قبول البحث: ١٩ آذار ٢٠٢٣